ILO/SKILLS-AP/HRD Korea

NATIONAL WORKSHOP ON THE ROLE OF SOCIAL PARTNERS IN WORKPLACE LEARNING AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT

8-9 December 2010
APINDO Headquarters, Jakarta
CONTENTS

Glossary iii
Acronyms iv

A. Background 1

B. Sessions 2
   Session 1: Opening speeches 2
   Session 2: Where do we stand? Do you think… 2
   Session 3: Where do we stand? Factual statements 3
   Session 4: Lifelong learning and training pathways 4
   Session 5: Bridging the gaps through skills-needs identification 5
   Session 6: Bridging the gaps through workplace learning 6
   Session 7: Bridging the gaps through public-private partnerships 8
   Session 8: What's next? 9
   Recommendations to be added to the draft Jobs Pact 9

C. Closing 10

Annex 11
   1. Programme 11
   2. Students’ learning pathways and discussion 12
   3. Participants 17
   4. Power point presentations 19
   5. References 37
### GLOSSARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic skills</td>
<td>Associated with subject areas (math, literacy) and generally measured through standardized scores.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competency-based Training (CBT)</td>
<td>Training based on the requirements needed to operate effectively in industry and achieve competency standards. Competency-based training focuses on the skills and knowledge that individuals have rather than on how they attained the skills and knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generic skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core work skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employability skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifelong learning</td>
<td>The process of acquiring knowledge or skills throughout life via education, training, work and general life experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pathways</td>
<td>A path or sequence of learning or experience that can be followed to attain competency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training pathway</td>
<td>A course offering students the opportunity for recognition of earlier credits from training (certificates) and work experience (prior learning) that is part of an education or career pathway; it also enables people to access new training opportunities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnership in TVET</td>
<td>In vocational education and training, an association between a non-registered organization and a registered training organization to achieve recognized training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>The capability to respond, in a practised way, to the varying conditions and challenges posed by a situation, job or context; it is determined by the environment and needed to accomplish a goal or purpose.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills development</td>
<td>The development of skills or competencies that is relevant to the workforce and necessary for finding gainful and productive employment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills needs identification</td>
<td>A systematic process through which information is collected and that ensures the right skills are trained for a job or function.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical vocational education and training (TVET)</td>
<td>Post-compulsory education and training, excluding degree-based and other higher-level programmes delivered by tertiary institutions, that provide people with occupational or work-related knowledge and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical skills</td>
<td>Skills associated with a profession that are generally a mix of specific knowledge and capabilities to perform a job.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value chain</td>
<td>The series of activities that a company carries out as it designs, makes, sells and delivers a product or service, with each activity adding value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace learning</td>
<td>Learning or training undertaken in the workplace, usually on the job, including on-the-job-training under normal operational conditions, and on-site training, which is conducted away from the work process (in a training room).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sources:**
- [www.unevoc.unesco.org](http://www.unevoc.unesco.org)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACRONYMS</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APINDO</td>
<td>Indonesian Employers' Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CITU</td>
<td>Confederation of Indonesian Trade Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO-Jakarta</td>
<td>ILO Country Office for Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoP</td>
<td>Community of Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWT-Bangkok</td>
<td>Decent Work Technical Support Team for East and South-East Asia and the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAST</td>
<td>Education and Skills Training for Youth Employment in Indonesia Project (ILO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GJP</td>
<td>Global Jobs Pact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD Korea</td>
<td>Human Resources Development Service of Korea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IJP</td>
<td>Indonesian Job Pact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JP</td>
<td>Jobs Pact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNE</td>
<td>Ministry of National Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOMT</td>
<td>Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Public Private Partnerships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SKILLS-AP</td>
<td>SKILLS Asia and the Pacific Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TREE</td>
<td>Training for Rural Economic Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCA</td>
<td>Value Chain Analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. Background

Investment in skills development for improved productivity and employment growth is a priority for every government. Such investment is critical to prepare a nation for long-term competitiveness and to recover from an economic slowdown similar to the one caused by the 2009 global financial crisis. Skills development includes training in the workplace, or workplace learning as it is commonly referred to as, and is an increasing trend within industry and the private sector as a response to emerging skills shortages caused by rapid technological changes and economic dynamics. Promoting workplace learning and linking it with the formal technical vocational education and training (TVET) system helps both workers and enterprises adjust to future economic challenges.

The Human Resources Development Recommendation, 2004 (No. 195) of the International Labour Organization suggests that constituents should “promote the expansion of workplace learning and training”. An International Labour Conference resolution adopted in 2008 further states that governments and their social partners should promote and proactively support skills development.

The 2010 national workshop in Jakarta was a follow-up to a regional workshop on workplace learning and quality assurance that took place in Incheon, Republic of Korea (April 2010). The Indonesian delegation (Didik Prihadi Sumbodo from the Indonesian Employers’ Association (APIINDO) and Ade Supriyadi from the Confederation of Indonesian Trade Unions (CITU)) to the regional workshop drafted recommendations for immediate action, which were presented in the follow-up workshop event in Jakarta. The national workshop fell in line with the priorities identified within the Indonesian Jobs Pact: namely to address productivity improvement and employment growth for sustainable recovery.

The national workshop’s main objective was to increase, among the constituents, awareness of ongoing skills development initiatives and reforms in relation to the challenges in addressing skills shortages and mismatches. Also emphasized was the importance of social partners’ involvement to narrow the skills mismatch. The workshop explored ways in which public policy and partnerships can be used to encourage enterprises and industries to make more effective use of and invest in the skills of their workforce. The workshop discussion aimed to provide a platform on how constituents can redefine their roles as change agents and effectively address the challenges of current vocational training and skills development.

The workshop took place on 8–9 December 2010 at the APIINDO Training Centre in Jakarta, with 25 participants. The agenda was designed to encourage participatory methods and included a mix of technical presentation sessions, question-and-answer (Q&A) sessions and group-work sessions. The technical presentations and Q&A sessions aimed to cultivate similar understanding on terminology and to bridge knowledge gaps. The workshop’s centrepiece was the working group sessions through which participants drafted recommendations for skills development for the Indonesian Jobs Pact.
B. Sessions

Session 1: Opening speeches
In his opening remarks, Peter Van Rooij, Country Director, CO-Jakarta, provided a brief background on the prominent role of skills development in Indonesia as reflected in the development plan and in the forthcoming Indonesian Jobs Pact, which are being designed as a recovery roadmap from the current financial crisis. He cited reforms in the TVET system to make it more responsive to the needs of industry, which has been a major concern, and to the role of workplace learning and human resources development at the industry and enterprise levels. He applauded the discussion platform offered through the workshop for social partners to address the constraints and opportunities of skills development and to identify their role in workplace training. He further welcomed the recommendations that the discussions would generate to strengthen the Indonesian Jobs Pact.

Kunjung Masehat, Director Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan (BNSP), opened the workshop on behalf of Abdul Wahab Bangkona, Acting Director General of the Directorate for Training and Productivity Development, Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration (MOMT). Mr Kunjung emphasized the Government’s commitment and concern towards ensuring that the labour force is well equipped to meet industry requirements for heightening Indonesia’s long-term competitiveness. He highlighted the need for effective social dialogue and sincere interaction between social partners in order to achieve collaboration that is based on trust and a shared vision for the country. The workshop’s format encouraged, he noted, a high level of interaction that can serve as the first step towards building a stronger social dialogue environment.

Sandra Rothboeck, Specialist on Skills and Employability, DWT-Bangkok, briefly explained the background of SKILLS-AP, the ILO/SKILLS-AP/HRD Korea collaboration and the objectives and expected outputs of the workshop. She remarked on the role and increasing importance of workplace learning in skills development overall and on how social partners in Indonesia can envisage a more prominent and active role in supporting and further expanding it by recognizing and formalizing skills acquired in the workplace. She then introduced the terminology to be used throughout the workshop discussions.

The facilitator introduced the participatory methodology for the workshop sessions and asked participants to agree on the rules and regulations.

Session 2: Where do we stand? Do you think…
Because the workshop participants represented various backgrounds, the discussion on skills development in Indonesia began with four warm-up questions to assess the group’s views on current challenges to skills development and employability in Indonesia:

Question 1: The number of jobs available is limited. On the other hand, there is a skills mismatch. If we ensure that the training system is more market oriented and needs-based, will it create greater demand and more jobs?
Most of the participants fully agreed that the training and skills development reforms can reduce the skills mismatch. However, there also seemed to be a consensus that unless employment creation and self-employment are proactively promoted with equal priority, the training and skills reforms will only have a limited impact on unemployment and underemployment.

Question 2: The changing needs of the market for a productive workforce require a multi-skilled and adaptable workforce. Do you think that in Indonesia, industry and workers do enough to effectively contribute and ensure that the vocational training system can produce this workforce?
The participants indicated that in general there is not enough commitment from all constituents when it comes to training and skills development. The workers believe that companies do not invest enough on
training their workforce. The APINDO representative indicated that there is no clear understanding on the roles and responsibilities when it comes to training. In general, the participants think that the Government should increase its commitment towards workforce development and employability so that companies can focus on product improvement and on-the-job training, which should lead to their sustainability.

**Question 3: Do you think that the recognition of skills and competencies acquired through training and work experience is effectively implemented through a nationwide certification system in Indonesia?**

Overall, the participants thought there is a sufficient certification system in place but that companies rarely acknowledge the certificates as a document for competency. More involvement from industry and social partners is necessary so that certificates gain more relevance, leading to students finding employment.

**Question 4: Do you agree that the Government should focus more on generic and employability skills, quality assurance of training and regulation while industry and private training providers focus on technical training?**

Most of the participants agreed that workplace experience and core work skills are absolutely critical for employability. They believe the role of the Government should be consistent and focused on implementing relevant training, particularly in the area of employability skills.

---

**Session 3: Where do we stand? Factual statements**

The objective of this group session was to assess the awareness and levels of understanding among the participants on skills development and workplace learning in Indonesia. Each group discussed one of the three challenge areas and whether government efforts and reforms are addressing the challenges. The participants identified which roles they could take to contribute towards improving the ongoing implementing process.

**a. Current training system and access to training for the poor**

The group thought the training system is too centralized and that the national Government needs to be more responsive to provincial gaps in delivering needs-based and quality training. The training programme delivered by the Ministry of National Education (MNE) and the MOMT, though increasingly well targeted and with better outreach, still must be improved. Efforts to improve relevance and quality of non-formal training for school drop-outs are particularly critical. The use of competency-based training (CBT) is preferred in formal and non-formal training; the competency of trainers and instructors on CBT and assessments also needs to improve.

The role of social partners is to ensure that training delivery is market based. The private sector should drive the reform process and be critically involved in planning, delivery and financing. While there are trade union links with the Government at the federation level and while employers have their own programmes, they rarely reach out to provincial and district areas. The lack of communication between the Government, training centres and companies limits the development of an effective training system. Social partners need to be proactive and take initiative to be involved, while the Government should accommodate training needs through an enabling approach.

**b. Current role of workplace learning in skills development**

The group firmly believed that there is a lack of awareness on the importance of human resources development and learning in the workplace for improving productivity. Neither the Government nor social partners have been proactively promoting the need for industries and companies to invest in their workforce. Training delivery in companies is largely a result of individual interest and strategy. Most Indonesian enterprises, particularly small and medium ones, invest very little in training; typically the investment is directed towards management, with very little, if any, for workers. Currently, training is considered costly and many companies do not have long-term plans. High attrition rates in certain companies further contribute to the low investment in training of non-managerial staff. The group discussed how workplace learning should be more formal and structured and should be recognized by the training system. Social partners should actively voice the need for their involvement in planning.
c. Effectiveness of the training system with regard to employability
The group addressed the current challenges of the training system in Indonesia for youth. Having access to labour market information, acquiring skills (particularly core work skills) and some workplace experience are particularly relevant to the industry and would increase their employability. There is a general perception that employability in the formal labour market increases with tertiary sector education. Consequently, early training choices, which are often influenced by the family’s available income, define where the trainees enter the labour market.

The group appreciated the Government’s current efforts to expand and reform the training sector. However, the planning and delivering processes for training are still not market oriented, though ongoing reforms are increasingly looking at industrial sectors, which can lead to employment creation. There was scepticism of whether training reforms alone will be sustainable, because only the supply side is effectively addressed while the demand side lacks employment opportunities and decent jobs. The current mismatch between trained job seekers and the number of jobs available can be attributed to the poor synchronizing between various ministries and the lack of policy compatibility. The group stated that economic growth should not lead to jobless growth, and policies and development strategies need to address employment creation as a long-term goal. Reforms thus need to focus on both employment creation and productivity. Skills for overall productivity improvement will only be effective if they are absorbed by the labour market.

The role of constituents and social partners: The Government should continue ongoing reforms and should direct various ministries to create a policy environment that favours inclusive and job-rich growth. The business sector should expand their internship programmes and apprenticeships opportunities and provide a facilitating role for better training-employment links. Trade unions can conduct skills and technical training and provide access to job or other training opportunities. The unions should also offer training on work safety and workers’ rights, counselling support and job information.

Session 4: Lifelong learning and training pathways
The session opened with the presentation from four students, each from a different training centre. The students briefly described their social and economic background, the reason why they chose the particular training centre and talked of the role of counselling, workplace experience and certification for successful employment in their experience.

During the discussion, each group reiterated the current and potential future pathways for students and identified the following four challenges and gaps to further training or successful employment:

a. Counselling and lack of information
The discussion revealed that the awareness level among students on the importance of lifelong learning is very low. In the absence of a functioning counselling and career guidance system, people rely on limited information regarding choice of training, further education and employment. Many students choose a training direction based on limited information and make decisions based on the income of their parents. Informal networks are most critical for employment and placement. Counselling in schools should focus on the world of work and employment and career development; the training of teachers and professional counsellors will be critical.

b. Pre-employment training
Formal training schools rarely provide opportunities to gain work experience. Pre-employment training, where provided, is insufficient because it lacks relevance and active mentoring and support. Mentors in companies have an obligation and responsibility to guide interns, which is often not the case in practice. There is a need for regulation to ensure that guided training and mentoring takes place.

c. Core work skills and employability skills
The awareness level within training centres on the importance of generic or core work skills for education and career is very low. Core work skills have low priority in the TVET system in comparison to the
technical focus. Most of the time, training is not practical or relevant enough; in many instances, instructors lack industry experience.

d. System support certification
Certificates and assessments provided by formally accredited agencies (Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan and Lembaga Sertifikasi Profesi Teknisi Otomotif) and work certificates provided by companies are considered critical for placement and employment; however, this has not secured placement. The industry and private sector still only marginally rely on certificates, and informal networks are often the dominant source for recruitment. Fees for certification are often a disincentive, which explains the relatively low level of assessment and certification. Given the costs involved, the situation of recognizing prior learning needs to be addressed.

Session 5: Bridging the gaps through skill-needs identification

During the “round-robin” session, participants were introduced to the four methodologies that identify skill needs and were asked to reflect on their potential involvement:

a) How can engaging all relevant parties improve the approach?

b) How does the role of government, trade unions and industry improve the approach?

c) How could social partners make use of the approach?

At the end of the session, resource persons led their groups to review the inputs and to propose three priority areas that they considered most important (see Annex 1 for the complete results of this session).

Group 1: Patrick Daru, Chief Technical Adviser, Education and Skills Training for Youth Employment in Indonesia (EAST) Project, CO-Jakarta, presented an iterative approach to identifying training needs and skills gaps. The approach was used in the EAST Project in different provinces and relied on multiple sources of information available: statistical data provided in development plans; focus group discussions with industry, government and training providers at the provincial levels; and a community employment assessment. The involvement of all stakeholders to verify data and findings (triangulation) provided a sound baseline for effective implementation.

The discussion focused on the following aspects: Formal and informal trust-building actions and the involvement of all relevant parties at all levels is needed to ensure the success of an exercise – all parties must feel a strong ownership of the exercise and see its value for their own activities in order for the skills gap analysis to be used as a first step for future partnerships (apprenticeships, placement, access to capital, etc.).

There is a need to institutionalize tripartite consultation as part of this initial process to ensure that future skills improvements are linked to placement, measurable productivity and wage improvement.

The timing of the exercise should be linked to the Muserembang process (government consultations) for yearly budgeting in order for skills trainings to benefit from government subsidies.

While the community employment assessment provides a good picture of the skills in demand in the informal economy, the jobs created following the ensuing trainings may not be sustainable, and a value chain approach may complement the tool to also promote integration of small businesses into the formal economy.

Group 2: Lucky Ferdinand Lumingkewas, Project Coordinator, ILO EAST-Maluku, focused on how value chain analysis (VCA) can be used as a tool for skill-needs assessment along the value chain of a particular sector. He spotlighted the seaweed sector, which the Maluku provincial government considers as strategic.

The approach provides a systematic tool to i) assess economic and employment potential at different levels of the value chain, ii) identify potential bottlenecks and needs for improvement to ensure that a sector/industry can expand and iii) ensure the employment opportunities expected. The VCA includes
forward and backward links, takes into account existing spatial planning based on local resources and promotes tripartite collaboration for employment creation at the community level.

The VCA often starts from the demand side and relates the same to the supply side at a later stage. Often, the market drives the supply of a product or service. The skill-needs assessment could be identified from the sales/marketing side of the product/service down to the transportation/distribution side or to the processing of a product then to the inputs side of the product/service. A skill-needs assessment within the VCA could help the chain to work efficiently and produce the best product or service.

Important input from the discussion: The VCA needs a regional macro-planning perspective and must consider the economic growth potential of a sector that a government is promoting. The VCA needs to include and assess current investments and other macro economic developments that also include employment trends and investment in education and training.

Individuals from government, trade unions and employers’ organizations should be involved in the VCA process as a part of regional planning, with inputs from macro-planning perspectives, to identify employment opportunities and skill needs in the provinces.

**Group 3: Srinivas Reddy, Skills Specialist, EAST Project, CO-Jakarta**, focused on the community employment assessment as a method to identify employment and business opportunities and skills needs for inclusion in the Training for Rural Economic Empowerment (TREE) Project.

The community employment assessment approach includes:

- community profiling
- consumer demand survey
- market opportunity survey
- feasibility studies
- training-needs assessment.

The overall discussion highlighted the need for a demand-driven and market-sensitive skill-needs assessment, which should be motivated by industry and have a long-term perspective. Any form of training should be focused on market efficiency and employment creation, which can only be achieved if relevant actors and different departments are part of the process. The community employment assessment, although a strong instrument for involving a community, should be directed by an external facilitator who can further reflect on the market and policy environment to ensure that potential sectors or business opportunities identified are feasible and realistic. It is critical that actors with decision-making powers and capacities conduct the training-needs assessments.

**Session 6: Bridging the gaps through workplace learning**

The “speed-geeking” session provided opportunity for resource persons to explain their experiences in implementing workplace learning in their companies; both are members of APINDO: **Mangasi Simanjuntak, JST Mfg. Co., Ltd.**, a multinational connector manufacturer (Chairman of the Division of Industrial Relation and Advocacy) and **Amol Titus, PT Indorama Synthetics**, a textile and chemical multinational (Strategic Adviser). Another resource person, **Didik Prihadi Sumbodo** (APINDO, Productivity Specialist and Programme), presented the action plan from the Workplace Learning and Quality Assurance Regional Learning Workshop (in the Republic of Korea, April 2010). The three resource persons requested feedback from participants to improve the implementing of workplace learning.

**a. APINDO**

Mr Sumbodo emphasized the need to systematically link workplace learning to productivity improvement, which provides the incentive for all parties to stay competitive and increase productivity of an enterprise. Management and trade unions should be involved in the planning of workplace learning and measuring the direct impact of training to productivity improvement. Both social partners have a responsibility to
effectively address the timing of training so that the needs of employers and workers are met (such as training during or after work). Overall, workplace learning should be a win-win situation.

The discussion further focused on the Government’s role to promote workplace learning through incentive systems and certification. The role of external training providers is critical so that a workplace is professionalized and more structured. While public training institutions should focus on generic lower-competency levels, it should be the responsibility of industry to finance and focus on specialized skills training for workplaces. Through an action plan, APINDO and CITU have suggested a pilot project with ten small and medium-sized enterprises to address and promote workplace learning while monitoring and measuring productivity improvements after training. Lobbying and promoting are required to increase the awareness of the role of workplace learning for enterprise growth. Trade unions should be involved in the monitoring of productivity improvement, ensure the participation of workers and provide information and career counselling support.

b. JST Mfg. Co., Ltd. (JST)
As a Japanese subsidiary and in line with Japanese tradition, JST has long invested in providing on-the-job training and coaching. According to Mr Simanjuntak, investing in training is about retaining workers and ensuring high productivity and performance from them. Training at JST includes induction training and a strong mentoring/coaching culture. There is a workers’ representative in each of the departments who monitors workers’ performance. Training is mostly mentor based and on the job, and significant investments have been made into mentors to support, facilitate and monitor performance of the trainees.

The discussion ended with a call for recognizing trade unions in the workplace to ensure a functioning social dialogue.

c. PT Indorama Synthetics (Indorama)
Indorama Synthetics also has a well-integrated training programme to ensure a highly versatile and productive labour force. Regular interactive training-needs assessments are part of an annual training-needs analysis in which various department heads are consulted and encouraged to propose ways to innovate and improve the work culture; all staff and workers are invited to suggest proactive initiatives. Indorama provides cross-functional training programmes and provides, as part of its corporate culture as a learning organization, a minimum of 16 hours of training during working hours per annum for each employee. The corporation links training investments to performance appraisals. At the end of a training, staff/workers receive an internal certificate. The corporation also encourages women for leadership positions.

Training is provided either in house or through external providers, such as the Indonesian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (KADIN), APINDO or through a university. Trainers from different countries are also trained in order to harmonize the skill levels among the corporation’s subsidiaries.

Indorama has increasingly trained its suppliers to improve their quality and delivery performance. The corporation plans to set up a polytechnic institute for middle managers and technicians and seeks potential collaborative partners.

The ensuing discussion emphasized the need to acknowledge workplace learning as integral to any national or regional workforce development strategy in Indonesia. Overall, participants believed the link between productivity and workplace performance and workplace learning should be strengthened. At the company level, it can link to individual performance appraisals. There was an agreement that all constituents play a significant role in promoting workplace learning. Trade unions can be proactive partners for enterprise restructuring and workplace learning, which will contribute to increasing the profitability of the enterprise as well as worker retention and performance. Trade unions can also help ensure equal opportunities for all (including access for people with a disability and promoting women) and manage implementation. The Government’s role is to increase awareness and promote workplace learning through well-tailored incentive mechanisms and support programmes for small and medium enterprises. It is critical that the Government provide for skills recognition so that workers can pursue career pathways and are encouraged to be lifelong learners. Linking workplace learning with the National Vocational
Training System is also critical to make TVET more responsive, especially as industry-based training and learning becomes more explicit and accessible. Workplace learning should be available for the entire supply chain to increase the quality and efficiency of products, services and, equally important, the competencies of the workforce in small and medium enterprises. The participants agreed that the ILO should support a benchmarking study of successful case studies for workplace learning that is based on social dialogue and has resulted in productivity improvements, employment expansion and wage increases.

Session 7: Bridging the gaps through public-private partnerships

After a brief summary of the first-day’s discussions, Sandra Rothboeck, DWT-Bangkok, introduced this session with an overview of public-private partnerships (PPPs). She highlighted the advantages and introduced the different forms and examples in TVET. Abdul Wahab Bangkona, Acting Director General for Training and Productivity Improvement, MOMT, and Srinivas Reddy, EAST Project, CO-Jakarta, talked about the Government and the EAST project’s experiences with PPPs.

Mr Bangkona outlined the recent shift of the MOMT towards market-oriented and quality TVET, in which PPPs and the private-sector involvement play critical roles. Although a standards and qualification system is in place, the mechanism for multi-actor involvement is not realized effectively. Given the limited financial and qualified human resources, the current training systems face significant challenges, particularly at the provincial and district levels, in terms of information dissemination, outreach and capacity building. Mr Bangkona emphasized the need to harmonize the available resources and infrastructure and urged an optimizing of training provisions as per the needs and requirements of the regions and districts.

Current training materials need to reach all regions and instructor training. An assessment of the training provision is critical and should not limit itself to public training institutions but should also include assessment at the enterprise level. Company training, in order to ensure learning opportunities for the workforce, needs to go beyond short-term induction training at the operator level. Higher-level workplace learning and training, however, requires a cadre of master trainers and mentors who are well qualified, accredited and certified. A responsive TVET system requires a stronger collaboration between departments, industry and the private sector, including the active role of trade unions.

PPP stands for a partnership in which all actors are equally involved. Trade unions and staff from the private sector could take on the role of master trainers and take on more active roles in training, mentoring and assessing to increase the quality and relevance of training at local levels. Trade unions are critical to reach out to workers in enterprises to ensure continuous training and certification/assessment. The establishment of a labour market information resource and public employment centres will be critical to ensure better employment and training outcomes. Finally, Mr Bangkona spelled out the need for flexible and proactive approaches that can contribute towards better outreach and implementing of market-oriented and relevant training and assessment.

Mr Reddy talked of PPPs within the fisheries sector in Maluku. A hundred youths were trained as seamen in Maluku province as a result of a unique partnership implemented between the EAST Project and a leading fishing company, PT Pusaka Benjina Resources. This partnership was implemented in collaboration with seven other actors:

- Department of Manpower, government of Aru district
- Government Vocational School for Fisheries, Dobo, Aru district
- Ambon Senior High School, under the Ministry of Marine Affairs and Fisheries
- Indonesian Seafarers Union
- LPPM, an NGO in Ambon, Maluku
- Leer Vivin Foundation, a local NGO in Dobo.

The partnership facilitated a successful match between job seekers and employers. The government schools for fisheries and seafarers successfully implemented a competency-based training programme. Occupational safety and health issues were already mainstreamed into the training modules. The Indonesian Seafarers Union conducted awareness programmes on career prospects within the fishing
profession and aspects relating to safety at sea. Benjina Resources agreed to recruit all the trained graduates and organized an orientation programme for their induction into the company. Forty-seven of the 100 young workers have already been deployed on a fishing vessel, and the rest are expected to follow in batches. The young workers are employed on a minimum monthly wage of 1.2 million rupiah (US$128), which is above the legal provincial minimum wage of 1.01 million rupiah; they also receive bonuses linked to the amount of fish caught.

Session 8: What’s next?

During the “open space” session, participants were divided into four groups. Each group received a list of 12 priority areas that were identified during the workshop and are related to skills development and workplace learning. While discussing which role government, industry and trade unions should take to improve the current status, the groups were asked to identify the three most urgent areas that they would want to be jointly taken up and put forward as recommendations for the Jobs Pact. The discussion further addressed the potential role for the ILO.

The proposed joint actions were presented and are summarized in the following six recommendations, which were forwarded to the tripartite committee responsible for the drafting of the Indonesian Jobs Pact.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations to be added to the draft IJP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Integrate skills and employment into economic and social planning at the national and provincial levels, with strong involvement of social partners at the drafting and implementing stages. Proactively build trust between the social partners to expand their roles and involvement in skills development planning, regulation, training delivery, quality assurance and assessment. Promote sector-specific tripartite councils for strategies on how to increase competitiveness and jobs through skills development, and optimize the current training provision and infrastructure through different forms of PPPs, involving all social partners.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Address decentralization and build capacities of social partners, NGOs and government agencies at the regional and local levels to address employment and skills development. In particular, i) invest in the training of instructors on delivery and assessment, ii) improve the efficiency of the dissemination of training materials and standards, iii) facilitate better coordination among government departments and iv) strengthen social dialogue and tripartism. Map out and harmonize skills development at the provincial level to make the most of existing human resources and infrastructure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Map out training pathways, identify barriers and then tackle those barriers as part of the multi-entry–multi-exit skills development policy and forthcoming National Qualification System. In particular: i) actively promote the recognition of prior learning through an upgraded certification system and government incentives and ii) improve labour market information flows to allow Indonesians to make fact-based education and job decisions. Increase workers’ access to information about vacancies and available trainings, and strengthen employment and counselling services to promote lifelong learning, increase labour market efficiency and reduce unemployment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Promote the role of workplace learning in productivity improvement through the strong involvement of all social partners. Establish mechanisms that optimize workplace learning and lead to measurable productivity increases that can be linked to performance and wages through a systematic social dialogue process. Provide incentives to small and medium enterprises to provide workplace learning opportunities through a value chain approach to economic development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Actively invest in promoting work and generic skills as being central for employability. Involve workers’ representatives in the design and delivery of core work skills training programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Promote inclusiveness: Identify and tackle barriers to gender equality and to the participation of vulnerable Indonesians and those with disabilities in skills-development programmes. Promote learner-centred methodology that takes into account past experiences and learning specificities of trainees.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The participants agreed that all actors need to take a more proactive role towards improving collaboration and implementation of current skills training and to contribute to higher employability and labour market outcomes. The participants see the ILO’s role in the areas of capacity building of constituents, the sharing and documenting of good and successful practices and in facilitating trust building among the social partners.

C. Closing

Sandra Rothboeck, DWT-Bangkok, and the workshop facilitator led the closing session and thanked all the participants from the MOMT, the MNE, the provincial governments, APINDO and the trade unions for their contributions during the two days, as well as the resource persons and the ILO country office, both of which provided valuable technical and administrative support to ensure and facilitate a lively debate. They acknowledged and thanked APINDO for its facilities for the workshop. Ms Rothboeck reminded the group that the workshop’s intent was to help constituents identify critical challenges in the training system and in the provision of workplace learning in Indonesia and to encourage them to reflect on their role and their current and potential involvement in delivering both. The expected outcome was, in a joint statement, that the constituents would provide tangible recommendations for the Indonesian Jobs Pact for consideration. Summarizing the discussions and further steps to be taken as a follow up, Ms Rothboeck emphasized that this was only the beginning and urged everyone to take their action points and recommendations forward. She suggested that all participants enrol in the Community of Practice discussion to continue the conversations from the workshop.
ANNEXES

1. Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>SESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 -</td>
<td>A. Registration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 -</td>
<td>B. Opening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:40 -</td>
<td>C.1. Where Do We Stand? Do you think ... To identify participants’ view</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:05</td>
<td>C.2. Where Do We Stand? Factual Statements To create a common</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:05</td>
<td>11:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>D. Lifelong Learning (LLL) and Training Pathways To review the typical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:45</td>
<td>E. Bridging The Gap #1 through Skills Needs Identification To assess</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>F. Bridging The Gap #2 through Workplace Learning (WPL) To get an</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:45</td>
<td>Day 1 Closing &amp; Evaluation By Facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 -</td>
<td>Summary Of Day 1 By Facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:05</td>
<td>G. Bridging The Gap #3 through Public-Private Partnership (PPP) To</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>H. What’s Next? To prioritize appropriate interventions by learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>I. Closing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Day 2, 9 December 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>SESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09:00 -</td>
<td>G. Bridging The Gap #3 through Public-Private Partnership (PPP) To</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>H. What’s Next? To prioritize appropriate interventions by learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00</td>
<td>H. What’s Next? (Contd.) Dynamic working groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:45</td>
<td>I. Closing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Students’ learning pathways and discussion points on learning pathways

Group 1

| Lifelong learning in the Indonesian context | • Support from teachers and employers is absolutely critical.  
| | • Motivation needs to come from students.  
| Role of pre-employment training | • Internships and on-the-job training are absolutely critical for employability. It is important that internships are well guided and mentored and certified.  
| Role of core work skills and employability skills | • Curriculum is not practical.  
| | • Training is not in line with the needs of community/area/potential.  
| Role of workplace learning, on-the-job training, and industry and trade unions | • Workplace learning and on-the-job training is effective and should also be to be delivered in schools.  
| | • It needs regulation.  
| Role of mentoring | • Career counselling (at school) should be more systematically done and focus on employability.  
| | • Need to increase teachers capacity and knowledge  
| System support: certification | • Certification is not acknowledged.  
| Stakeholder support | • Government and employers need to coordinate for more effective apprenticeships.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Group 2</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lifelong learning in the Indonesian context</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lifelong learning exists, but the quality is questionable and finances are still a challenge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role of pre-employment training</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Very helpful for the industry and job seekers (builds confidence).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role of core work skills and employability skills</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The significant role of working skills and core work skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role of workplace learning, on-the-job training, and industry and trade unions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Trade unions have provided information for employees to develop themselves.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role of mentoring</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mentoring is very important to support the learning process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Career counselling is very important to plan students’ careers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>System support: certification</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A support system (teachers, counsellors, parents) is very important to ensure study completion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Certification (internship and vocational training centre) increases students’ confidence and adds value to their CVs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stakeholder support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stakeholder support:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- apprenticeship/internship placements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- counselling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- government can provide scholarships and facilities to BLK.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Lifelong Learning in the Indonesian Context
- Indonesia does not yet have a clear integrated lifelong learning concept.

### Role of Pre-Employment Training
- The role of pre-employment training is significant but is still too wide and needs to be more focused to the job market, workplace learning, and apprenticeships.

### Role of Core Work Skills and Employability Skills
- The role of core work skills needs to be improved for better job competency.

### Role of Workplace Learning, On-the-Job Training, and Industry and Trade Unions
- The role of workplace learning is significant for increasing productivity and improving career paths.
- On-the-job training also plays a significant role in providing opportunities for job seekers.
- Trade unions do not yet have a role in creating jobs.

### Role of Mentoring
- Mentoring programmes are not yet common in employment, industry, or education.

### System Support: Certification
- Support system and certification lacks a clear concept and is not yet optimized.

### Stakeholder Support
- Stakeholder support does not exist yet, unless in some national and multinational companies or NGOs.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Group 4</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**PATHWAYS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>PRE-EMPLOYMENT</strong></th>
<th><strong>EMPLOYMENT</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Entry</strong></td>
<td><strong>Work</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Entry</strong></td>
<td><strong>Exit</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Lifelong learning in the Indonesian context</strong></th>
<th>• Depends on information, quality and self-motivation.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Role of pre-employment training** | • Internship  
• Lack of opportunities to develop soft/core work skills |
| **Role of core work skills and employability skills** | • Extracurricular and student organizations on campus. |
| **Role of workplace learning, on-the-job training, and industry and trade unions** | • Training management is not obtained from school but from employers. |
| **Role of mentoring** | • Learning by doing is common in workplaces.  
• Vocational Trainers are important to provide information prior to entering employment, including providing soft skills. |
| **System support: certification** | • No certification for autodidact skills. |
| **Stakeholder support** | • Certification  
• Counselling  
• Information  
• Coordination: BLK and employers  
• Multi-entry law enforcement |
Lifelong learning in the Indonesian context

- Lifelong learning is possible in the current system.

Role of pre-employment training

- Pre-employment training is critical.
- Choice of SMK is critical.

Role of core work skills and employability skills

- Leadership skills must be provided.
- Internships are critical, along with certificate of internship.

Role of workplace learning, on-the-job training, and industry and trade unions

- Workplace learning is very important; get it from internships.

Role of mentoring

Mentoring and counselling:
- Counsellor is critical.
- Counsellor needs to be a specialist in employment placement.
- Guidance needed.

System support: certification

Certification:
- SMK certificate requires fee
- Accounting, computer, English, taxation -> LSP

Stakeholder support

- Stakeholder support needed.
- Companies need to start appreciating certificates.
### 3. Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Telephone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Wahab Bangkona</td>
<td>Direktur Jenderal Pembinaan, Pelatihan &amp; Produktivitas</td>
<td>Kementerian Tenaga Kerja &amp; Transmigrasi/Ministry of Manpower &amp; Transmigration</td>
<td>021 526 2643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amol Titus</td>
<td>Strategic Advisor</td>
<td>PT. Indorama Synthetics</td>
<td>0815 881 5555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andi Hadiar Putra, SE, Msi, MA.</td>
<td>Bidang Diklat, Antar Lembaga &amp; Hubungan Luar Negeri</td>
<td>DPP KSPI</td>
<td>0813 1010 6059</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anton Lailossa</td>
<td>Kepala Bidang Ekonomi, SDA, Lingkungan</td>
<td>BAPPEDA, Maluku</td>
<td>0813 284 41226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aprillia Damayanti</td>
<td>Deputy Manager of Corp.HR &amp; OD</td>
<td>PT. Indorama Synthetics</td>
<td>0856 290 2249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bambang Riznanto</td>
<td>Kasubag Evaluasi &amp; Pelaporan, Badan Pengkajian Kebijakan Iklim &amp; Mutu Industri</td>
<td>Kementerian Perindustrian / Ministry of Industry</td>
<td>0818 618 534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bernhard Simanjuntak, Ir, M.Msi</td>
<td>Kasubdit Registrasi &amp; Pemberdayaan Intal, Dir Bina Intala</td>
<td>Kementerian Tenaga Kerja &amp; Transmigrasi / Ministry of Manpower &amp; Transmigration</td>
<td>0816 186 4218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Didik Prihadi Sumbodo</td>
<td>Productivity Specialist &amp; Program</td>
<td>APIINDO</td>
<td>0812 842 5252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dra. Hj. Eryatun Kuswara, M.Pd</td>
<td>Kepala Sekolah SMK Negeri 8</td>
<td>SMK Negeri 8 Jakarta</td>
<td>0812 109 99098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dyan Nuranindya</td>
<td>Alumni Perbanas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endro Catur</td>
<td>Facilitator</td>
<td>Jakarta</td>
<td>0855 544 4851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fauzia Rizkiana Aji, ST</td>
<td>Staf Evaluasi &amp; Laporan</td>
<td>BBPLKLN CEVEST Bekasi</td>
<td>0812 932 8165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gestian Djati</td>
<td>Kepala Bagian Perencanaan Umum</td>
<td>Kementerian Tenaga Kerja &amp; Transmigrasi / Ministry of Manpower &amp; Transmigration</td>
<td>021 529 01142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gilang Amaldi, B.ENG</td>
<td>Instruktur Teknologi Mekanik</td>
<td>BBPLKLN CEVEST Bekasi</td>
<td>0817 002 3477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gorn S</td>
<td>ILO Consultant</td>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>0816 707 747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ir. Wayan Darmawa, MT</td>
<td>Kepala BAPPEDA</td>
<td>BAPPEDA Provinsi NTT</td>
<td>0812 237 68479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johanes Chaniago</td>
<td>Training Manager of Spun Yarn Division</td>
<td>PT. Indorama Synthetics</td>
<td>0815 900 5152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kanti Wiryanti</td>
<td>Murid Pelatihan Kejuruan Bahasa Inggris</td>
<td>BBPLKLN CEVEST Bekasi</td>
<td>0856 95128933</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kaustabh Acharya</td>
<td>Head Manufacturing Poly Division</td>
<td>PT. Indorama Synthetics</td>
<td>0813 106 33117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kunjung Masehat</td>
<td>Director of Directorate of Institution Facilities Training Development</td>
<td>Mennakertrans Jakarta</td>
<td>0811 928 709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. A Zakarias</td>
<td>PPKPI/SKPSI</td>
<td>KSPI</td>
<td>0812 260 811489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucky Lumingkewas</td>
<td>PPC Maluku</td>
<td>ILO EAST-Maluku</td>
<td>0812 194 19452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mangasi Simanjuntak, SH</td>
<td>Chairman of the Division of Industrial Relation &amp; Advococen</td>
<td>DPK APIINDO Kab.Bekasi, PT. J.S.T. Indonesia</td>
<td>0856 9141 0179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marvin</td>
<td>Member</td>
<td>KSPI</td>
<td>021 798 9005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N. Sanap</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>KSPI</td>
<td>021 797 1766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick Daru</td>
<td>ILO EAST CTA</td>
<td>CO-Jakarta</td>
<td>021 391 3112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Srikkanth</td>
<td>Head Manufacturing Spun Yarn Division</td>
<td>PT. Indorama Synthetics</td>
<td>0812 101 8801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Risma S.</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>SMK Negeri 8 Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Sandra Rothboeck</td>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>DWT-Bangkok</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Srinivas Reddy</td>
<td>ILO EAST Expert</td>
<td>CO-Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Syafril Arsyad</td>
<td>Treasure/Bendahara</td>
<td>DPP KSPSI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Tendi Gunawan</td>
<td>CO-Jakarta - National Programme Officer</td>
<td>CO-Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Toto Nurhandajanto</td>
<td>Kepala Bidang Pelatihan dan Pemagangan</td>
<td>Disnaker Jawa Timur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Wanda Moennig</td>
<td>TVET Specialist</td>
<td>ILO-EAST Banda Aceh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Yusuf Muhyiddin</td>
<td>Kasubdit Peningkatan Mutu Kursus, Direktorat Jendral Pendidikan Non Formal &amp; Informal</td>
<td>Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional / Ministry of National Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Power point presentations

- Let us clarify some Term

1. What is Skills Development

- The development of skills or competencies that are relevant to the workforce to find gainful and productive employment.

Skills are:

- The capability to respond, in a practiced way, to the varying conditions and challenges posed by our situation, jobs and context and are determined by our environment to accomplish a goal or purpose.

Types of skills

- Academic skills: associated with subject areas (e.g., Math, literacy, English) and generally measured through standardized scores.
- Generic/core work skills or employability skills: broader set of skills transferable across jobs, generally including thinking (critical and creative thinking, problem solving, etc.), behavioral (typically communication, organization, teamwork, and leadership skills) and computing skills.
- Technical skills: skills associated with one’s profession, which are generally a mix of specific knowledge and skills to perform jobs.

Where do we develop Skills?

We acquire skills through many ways at many levels:

- Pre-Employment (education, training)
- Employment on the job
- Continuous education and training
- Increasing focuses on the individual right of an individual to acquire skills and knowledge through Lifelong Learning.

⇒ Increased Emphasis: Skills Development which is relevant to Industry Needs.
⇒ New Focus: Workforce Development

2. We talk about Lifelong Learning today!

"Lifelong learning
The process of acquiring knowledge or skills throughout life via education, training, work and general life experiences."


Overview:

1. What is Skills Development?
2. We talk about LLL today
3. Challenges in Skills Development today
4. Bridging the Gaps
   A. Bridging the Gap: Create an environment for LLL
   B. Bridging the Gap: Skills Needs Identification and forecasting
   C. Bridging the Gap: Promotion of Workplace Learning
   D. Bridging the Gap: Promotion of Partnerships
5. References
6. Expected Outcomes
Today Skills must address

Economic Goals
- Competitiveness and Productivity
- Country
- Enterprises/Industry
- Individual

Individual Goals
- Maximize Employability and life-time incomes through LLL

Distributional Goals
- Addresses Poverty, Social Inclusion, and Equity
- Women
- People with Disability

3. Challenges today:
Public Sector:
- Public Training Sector cannot respond adequately to the skill/training requirements of enterprises.
- Relevance
- Skills Mismatch

Consequences for Enterprises:
- Enterprises themselves turn into centres of learning

However learning and training needs differ:
- Sector, Technologies and products,
- Competitive strategies,
- The speed of change within industries/sectors/market,
- The size of enterprises,
- The role within the enterprise office

Workplace Learning emerged from private needs and is enterprise focused

Who should do what in a changing learning environment?

Government role:
- Environment for learning and skills recognition to improve overall Skill Levels of workers.
- More involvement of private sector (Designing and delivery of training)

Enterprise should become:
- Learning organizations, continuously upgrade skills of the workforce
- Effectively use external training providers (e.g. SME’s)
- Actively involved in Training Providers

Workers should be:
- Adaptable, multi-skilled, life-long learning: learn how to learn
- Traditional view of workplace learning is changing slowly
- Learning by experience, on-the-job is most important form

Changing patterns of work organization - new focus on WFL

The Gap: How can we find together?

Some critical areas to be addressed

A. TVET and Education need to promote LLL and create responsive system and institutions (Policy, Regulation, Standards, Quality Assurance, Financing)

B. Workplace Learning needs to be promoted and recognized

C. Integration of Skills Development in Industry and Development Plans/Strategies

D. Partnerships and Training needs to be promoted and increased

E. Skills need to be understood and analysed through surveys, process of revision with benchmarking, training and other frameworks

A. Bridging the Gap: Create an environment for LLL

Pathways
A path or sequence of learning or experience that can be followed to attain competency.

Training Pathways
A courses offering students the opportunity for recognition of earlier credits from training (certificates) and work experience (prior learning) that is part of an education or career pathway. It also enables them to access new training opportunities.

**Educational/Training Pathway**

- **Primary**: 6-11 years
- **Secondary**: 11-16 years
- **Tertiary**: Vocational Technical, Bachelor’s Education and training
- **Secondary Vocational**: 1, 2, 3-year degree programmes, Master’s and Doctorate

---

**B: Bridging the Gap: Skills Needs Identification**

- Systematic process through which information is collected to ensure that the right skills are trained for a particular function or job.
- Skills demand is the first step towards making training effective for employability.

---

**C: Bridging the Gap: Promote Workplace Learning**

Learning or training undertaken in the workplace, usually on the job, including on-the-job training under normal operational conditions, and on-site training, which is conducted away from the work process (e.g., in a training room).

---

**Forms of workplace learning**

- Informal skills and knowledge transfer (e.g., by passing “hints and tips”, sharing ideas, passing information, observation, etc)
- Semi-structured learning (e.g., an experienced machine operator showing a new employee how to operate a particular machine)
- Formal training (e.g., apprenticeship programmes, training courses, etc)

---

**D: Public Private Partnerships in Training**

**Partnership**

In vocational education and training, an association between a non-registered organisation or company and a registered training organisation to achieve recognised training.

The ultimate goal is to provide high quality skills by sharing costs immediately or in future, by building infrastructure, providing consultancies. They may operate through fee-for-service, leasing arrangement, cost recovery or other means.

- Partnerships can involve physical infrastructure, equipment, curricula, materials and training personnel.

---

**References**

- [http://www.unesco.org](http://www.unesco.org)
Expected outcomes from this workshop:

- Participants will gain a better knowledge and understanding about the role and importance of skills training for a more productive workforce.
- Tripartite cooperation in the areas of skills development and training will be enhanced and the workers will have more opportunity to develop their skills in the Workplace.
- Participants will prioritize and draft first initial steps for towards an action plan for follow up.
- The action plan will contribute to the Indonesian Jobs Pact.

Thank you
- Lifelong Learning

We talk about Lifelong Learning today!

"Lifelong learning
The process of acquiring knowledge or skills throughout life via education, training, work and general life experiences."


Bridging the Gap: Create an environment for LLL

Pathways
A path or sequence of learning or experience that can be followed to attain competency.

Training Pathways
A courses offering students the opportunity for recognition of earlier credits from training (certificates) and work experience (prior learning) that is part of an education or career pathway. It also enables them to access new training opportunities.


Educational/Training Pathway

Primary
Pre-School

Secondary

Tertiary

Pre-Secondary
Vocational
Education and Training

Bachelor's degree, Graduate degree, Master's degree, Doctorate degree

Formal Pathways/Indonesia

Formal Pathways/Indonesia

Yogyakarta Formal Workers
Outputs from Session D

- Draft Pathway of the Presenter
- Identify potential challenges and obstacles for continuous training and learning.
- Identify potential challenges of employability.
- Review based on the 7 questions

Thank you
Bridging the Gap through Skills Demand Identification

Session: Bridging the Gap through Skills Demand Identification

Sandra Rothbauer
Specialist for Skills and Employability
Decent Work Team, Bangkok

Why we do have Skills Mismatch

- Lack of coordination between 'economic and employment growth strategy' and 'skills dev. strategy'
- Limited industry, employers' voice and Trade Union's reflected on qualifications (and thus training contents)
- Limited linkage between employers and Training Institutes
- Rigidity in the provision of training (e.g. limited autonomy of VETs, centralised training system)
- Outdated standards/curriculum
- Challenge in identifying skills demand in changing environment.

What is Skills Needs Identification?

- Systematic process through which information is collected to ensure that the right skills are trained for a particular function or job.
- Skills demand is the first step towards making training effective for employability.

Different methodologies for identifying skill demands

- Different methodologies include:
  1. Labour Force Survey (LFS) - based approach
  2. Enterprise-based surveys
  3. Sector-level analysis
  4. Area-based survey
  5. Policy-oriented approach
  6. Ecosystem approach (UK, Australia)

Today, methods are often mixed.

1. LFS - based approach

- The demand projection is based on the analysis of:
  - Growth patterns of occupation categories and wage
  - Emergence of new occupations (e.g. nano-technologists)
  - Identification of fast growing industries (e.g. service, IT sector)

Comment: Potentially sustainable source of info, but data are often limited and lack required details to guide the planning of training at the local level.

An Example from the US
2. Enterprise-based survey

Methods
- Questionnaire, or
  structured interview with
  samples of employers and
  workers
- Job, functional analysis
But...
- Potentially exhaustive,
  costly, requires large
  sample size, plus change
  in required skills too
  frequent

Findings
- Changes in required
  competencies and skills
  sets by occupational
  categories (incl. soft
  skills)
- Changes in work
  organization
- New occupations and skill
  sets
- Required entry
  qualification

3. Sector-level survey

• Methods include:
  - Sector specific analysis on occupation/wage
  - Includes focus-group discussion and enterprise-
    based survey
  - Identifies economic, technological and social
    changes in the sector for implications for skill
    requirements
  - Demand projection based on Sector Development
    Strategy (think first about how to improve the growth
    of the sector, then skills demand)
  - The task of identifying sector-level skills demand is
    done by Sector Skills Council, or equivalent (UK,
    South Africa)
  - Value-chain analysis

4. Area-based survey

• The projection based on a combination of:
  - Situational (SWOT) analysis of locality
  - Focus group discussion - employers, local govt,
    target groups (e.g. youth, women, other vulnerable
    groups)
  - Enterprise-based survey
  - Community-based assessment in identifying
    economic opportunities (e.g. ILO's CB-TREE)
  - LED approach (i.e. identification of what sub-sectors/
    businesses the district want to develop)

5. Policy-oriented approach

• Skill demands can be influenced by a specific
  policy and strategy:
  - FDI: employment policy (e.g. attraction of high value-
    added manufacturing)
  - Promotion of priority (sub-) sectors, technologies, or
    product lines
    • National level
    • Local level
    • Sector level
  - Other stimulation measures in raising skill demands

Stimulating demand of skills for enhanced productivity

• For encouraging skills upgrading of workers, first
  bring changes to product line, quality and
  production process
  - In particular in MSMEs need for skills/training is not
    obvious, nor priority
  - Skills needs arise, as enterprises attempt to improve
    productivity, technology, efficiency, how to diversify
    product lines
  - Promoting skills dev alone may not be effective. Need
    to adopt a holistic approach in line with sector/value
    chain development

The challenges

• Skills needs identification is often very
  complex
• It is not possible to predict the demand so
  accurately if it is only based on surveys
  and Analysis.
• Identification of demand is a part of
  multiple interventions, which are required
  for matching skill demand and supply.
Multiple level interventions

- **Policy level**
  - Greater coordination between economic and employment, and skills strategy
- **System level**
  - Development of NVQ/GNVQ
  - Competency-based certification
  - Setting up of LMI system
  - Setting up of Sector Skill Councils
  - Decentralization: greater autonomy to TIs
- **Ground/operational level**
  - Promotion of PPP (joint management of TIs)
  - Improving apprenticeship program
  - Career guidance, placement cell
  - Capacity building of TI on needs assessment
  - Performance-based funding to TIs

Critical: Need for Stronger link between ‘education and training sector’ and ‘world of work’

"Given the uncertainties about future skill demands, policies are needed to create tighter linkages between education and the workplace" (P. Cappells, a workshop on Research Evidence related to Future Skill Demands in the US, 2007)

This is a joint effort!
Consultations and involvement of key stakeholders from
- Governments,
- Academia,
- Industry,
- Training Sector,
- Workers’ organisations

ARE CRITICAL

In this Workshop we discuss
The workshop introduces selected methods, which were used during the implementation of the EAST Project.
1. Training Needs Assessment and Skills Gaps Analysis: Combination of different methods which were triangulated to assess skills gaps and needs
2. Value Chain Analysis
3. Community based Approach

Let us discuss in the Case of Indonesia:
- How do you think multi-stakeholder engagements can improve the approach?
- How does the involvement of Government, Trade Unions and Industry improve the approach?
- How could Social Partners make use of the approach?

Thank you
- Bridging the Gap through Workplace Learning

1. What is Workplace Learning?
- Learning or training undertaken in the workplace, usually on the job, including the job-training under normal operational conditions, and on-site training, which is conducted away from the work process (e.g. in a training room).
- Effective workplace learning provides enterprises with the capacity to innovate.
- Most WPL aligns with organisational goals of a company to stay competitive and have a continuous culture for improvement.

2. Workplace Learning today:
- Public Training Sector cannot respond adequately to the skills/training requirements of enterprises.
- Workplace Learning emerged from private needs and is enterprise-focused and is critical part of Skills Development of a nation today. Enterprises themselves turn into centres of learning.
- Traditional view to workplace learning is changing slowly. However, learning by experience, on-the-job skills, and Workplace Learning is critical contribution to ensure the highest performance enterprises.

Who should do what in a changing learning environment?
Government role:
- Environment for learning and skills recognition to improve overall skill levels of society.
- Incentive involvement of private sector (Designing and delivery of training).
Enterprises should become:
- Learning organizations, continually up-grade skills of the workforce.
- Effectively use external training providers (especially SME's).
Workforce should be:
- Adaptable, multi-skilled, lifelong learning: learn how to learn.

3. Forms of workplace learning
- Informal skills and knowledge transfer (e.g. by passing “hints and tips”, sharing ideas, passing information, observation, etc.)
- Semi-structured learning (e.g. an experienced machine operator showing a new employee how to operate a particular machine)
- Formal training (e.g. apprenticeship programmes, training courses, etc.)

Size matters!
- As enterprises grow, learning becomes formal and more structured (benefits both employers and workers):
  - Training plans,
  - Skills audits
  - HR/training manager to identify competency and training needs of staff
- SMEs don’t train less than Medium/Large enterprises: they train more informally! – owner/manager drives the process
- SMEs operate on a short-term, less diversified
- SMEs require different combinations of skills than those provided by formal courses - need customised training

Consider SME’s Role in Training, particularly for SME’s
The case of Singapore

- Competency-based system designed to build capacity of industry
- Assessment and certification based on ability (competency through training and work experience)
- Accessible to all workers and professionals
- Strong focus on Employability Skills
- Example of Workplace Literacy and Numeracy (WPLN) credentialing: Focus on migrant workers, low skilled women and adult education
- Over 300 employers / Training institutions in Tourism, F&V retail, health care, logistics, manufacturing, security recognise Workplace Literacy and Numeracy credentials.

Summary from the Regional Workshops (2008/2010)

Role of Government in skills development and WPL

Ensure inclusiveness
- Focus on basic/generic employability skills (pre-employment) to contribute to enterprise innovative capability.
- Remedial support – literacy and numeracy
- Support People with a disability (10%), vulnerable groups
- Retraining/re-employment of older retrenched or displaced
- Customised training for SMEs

Role of Government contd.

Create enabling environment for employers/trainers
- Create demand for skills development in SMEs
- Develop synergies between Training Providers, Enterprises/Govt.
- Promote and Invest directly in learning in the Workplace
- Promote partnership with Registered training providers

Skills Recognition and Standards for Qualification
- Integrate competency standards and national qualifications in enterprises (see Australia)
- Improves transferability of skills
- Increases transparency of assessment
- ‘Formalises’ and recognises training

B. Role of Social Partners in WPL:

- Networking, building associations (SMEs)
- Sector working councils
- Promote WPL and prior learning at policy level
- Tilt the fora on WPL
- Increase capacities of social partners

At enterprise level:
- Establish structured training, certification processes through partnership with registered Training Providers/government
- Address retention, focus on motivation of workforce
- Extend WPL and learning facilities to public institutions
- Create a learning culture and acknowledge learning
- Work Design Methods
- Involve worker’s organisations into training

Case: Trade Union learning programme, UK

- Government funded; managed by Trades Union Congress (TUC)
- Objective: to support participation by those in the workforce who are not currently taking part in learning, particularly those with basic skill needs
- 4,500 people trained as “Union Learning Representatives”
- Sectors: printing, transport, retail, low-paid workers in local government, hospitality/hotels

Some Case studies for SMEs

Korea:
- Ministry of Labour provides subsidy to SMEs for Training Partnership (Gov-Training Provider SME)
- Learning Communities: Subsidies of Training costs in core operations of SMEs (Facilities, material and personnel)
- High Performance Workplace Innovation Centre: Train SMEs CEO, HRD and Managers
- Assessment and Certification

Singapore (SDF): Skills Development Fund
- 1% payroll levy for Training and Certification on SME’s services, sector, less skilled workers, older workers + company training
- Covers 30-70% of training costs
- → effective and led to large expansion
Recent Developments in Thailand on WPL

- Skill Development Promotion Act B.E. 2545 (2002)
- Compulsory for enterprises with above 100 employees, then
  - Exemption on corporate income tax to 100% from actual training
  - Exemption on corporate income tax to 100% from actual expenses in in-house training as approved by the Ministry of Labor
- Act is in practice and Action Plan in Thailand is being implemented.

Indonesia: the banking sector has a 2.5% levy of labour costs for learning, including for workplace learning.

RO
Value Chain approach
Cluster development facilitation along with skills recognition (see India, Kenya), SCORE / AP (Cambodia, India, Sri Lanka)

Questions for discussion:
1. Please provide feedback to the presentation
2. Provide inputs and recommendations for further follow up in the case of Indonesia
3. What role can social partners take to promote WPL?

Thank you
- Workplace Learning – Results from Regional Workshop in Korea, April 2010

- **Policy/Macro Level**
  - **Create enabling Environment**
    - Policy guidance documents for WPL, data collection on ongoing WPL
    - Focus on effective implementation of existing policies, Work towards improvement
    - Focus on SMEs
    - Focus on mapping and matching of courses with employability (new and market based)
    - Promote attractiveness of VET System (manufacturing, industrial, jobs)
    - Upgradation of skills of Trainers, Master Trainers, Instructors
    - Lobby for higher expenditure on Training and Workforce Development
    - Incentivise Public Private Partnerships

- **Social Dialogue to promote WPL**
  - Foster Tripartism
    - Tripartite Awareness/Advocate/Anchor
    - Establish Tripartite National Steering committee on VET projects and reforms
    - Campaign on increase awareness levels of government, employers and workers
    - Promotion of Tripartite Body Committees
    - Training of social partners on their role in WPL
    - Increase capacities of social partners on WPL and skills development for better involvement, planning and delivery of training
    - Develop specific TOR/Role clarity for Social Partners

- **Actions back home**
  - **WE START FROM WHERE WE ARE**
    - Executive Summary/Report on WPL from workshop at Korea. Report back to country to Social partners and ILO and development action plan at Tripartite level
    - Conduct national Tripartite workshops (awareness) output workplace development plan and WPL guidance
    - Dissemination
    - Proposal for implementation
    - Pilot projects for selected companies for WPL for 1 year (focus on SMEs)
    - Bi-partite working groups for implementation
    - Mainstream WPL as part of policy implementation in businesses (e.g. institutional arrangements and subiside)
    - Training
    - Project implementation on WPL with strong documentation and monitoring for later dissemination and engagement with business community for scaling up
    - Employers Org. and Trade Unions should mobilise funds for promotion of WPL
Partnership in Workplace Learning

Focus on: WORKPLACE LEARNING PARTNERS

Effective workplace learning and partnerships to support workplace learning both need support from governments, employers and workers:
- Partnerships do not develop naturally
- Support is needed, particularly during the early stages
- Partnerships need to be a win-win situation for all

Public Private Partnerships today

- Public private partnerships (PPP) between industry and training providers, technical institutions and higher education institutions:
  - reduces costs
  - improves the effectiveness of skills development
- Today, workplace learning requires partnerships between all concerned parties: industry, workers and government, often at different stages and levels

Different Forms of PPP

Partnerships may take a number of forms:
- government and a key industry sector to provide support to employers when trainees attend training;
- industry and a public or private sector provider;
- workers and employers
- two or more employers to share the costs of providing training
- between training and higher education institutions

Forms of PPP

- Partnerships cover physical infrastructure, equipment, curricula, materials and training personnel.
- The ultimate goal is to provide high quality skills by sharing costs immediately or in future, by building infrastructure, providing consultancies. They may operate through fee-for-service, leasing arrangement, cost recovery or other means.

Benefits from PPP

- Organisation’s management focus on core activities;
- Specialised training organisations can
  - provide cutting-edge training (need to invest into and train their staff)
  - deliver customised training plans and training; safer costs and ensures quality
  - carry out assessments of employee competencies (before and after training);
  - provide formal accreditation and certification of skills through workplace learning;
- Small numbers of employees with specific learning needs can benefit
What Governments do to promote PPP

- Direct grants to employers for workplace-based services:
  - This system is not always sustainable beyond the funding period
- Government grants to training providers to establish partnerships with industry: more successful
- Funding for partnership development officers based in training centres:
  - to advise and promote partnership programme benefits to employers
  - train local training providers on how to meet and work with industry, is effective in the development of partnerships

Financing Public Private Partnerships

Some governments have established tax or levy systems to pay for training. Funds are used to:

- support public and private training providers
- fund workplace training by enterprises (Korea, Singapore)
- individual student or trainee scholarships etc. (Fiji, South Korea, Japan, Malaysia, Singapore and others)

Many countries are unable to establish such schemes

PPP Examples - Group Training Australia

- A Group training Company: employs trainees and apprentices who can work in small enterprises that would normally be unable to employ trainees
- Skill training modules can be customised to meet specific industries
- Courses are designed to ensure trainees gain specific skills needed for the job
- (Group training can be of great benefit to SMEs)

PPP Examples: combining 5 Industry sectors

- SkillWorks: Boston's Workforce Partnerships:
  - five specific industry sectors
  - brings together employers, non-profit agencies, educational institutions, trade unions and government to form partnerships that provide effective training
  - E.g. the International Institute of Boston includes partners such as Hilton Hotels to provide training in hospitality and tourism
- SkillWorks also includes partnerships between private sector and training providers in building construction, automotive skills, health care and a broader career path project (www.skill-works.org)

PPP Examples - Automotive clusters

- Durban Automotive Cluster South Africa:
  - PPP: Thembeka Municipality, automotive industry
  - Established in 2002
  - enjoys support of major players in the regional automotive industry
  - Drawing on the leadership and expertise of individuals from a broad range of member firms to address a wide variety of challenges confronting the industry including skills development

PPP Examples: Toyota T3 - Australia

- Trainees combine working and learning a career while still at school.
- During Years 11 and 12, they spend three-and-a-half days at school, half a day at TAFE, and one day of paid work.
- On completion, they receive a Year 12 Certificate, a nationally recognised qualification and a career pathway in the automotive industry.
- The T3 program now includes Ford, Holden and Mitsubishi and T3 representing Automotive Technology and Training for Tomorrow
PPP Examples – recognition of competencies

- There are many examples of partnerships between education and training providers and the private sector including:
  - Qantas Australia
  - Coles-Myers, Australia
  - McDonalds, UK
  - Network Rail, UK
  - Flyby budget airlines, UK
  - Sainsbury’s, UK

PPP Examples – government and employers

- A World Bank initiative: the Skills Development Council (SDC)
  - Employers’ Federation of Pakistan, private sector business and Government of Pakistan
  - SDC established in a number of provinces: very successful.
  - Aim: identify, develop and arrange Vocational, Technical / Professional and IT Training Programmes.
  - Flexible Training Programs, demand driven and cost effective with maximum participation from the Employers.

PPP Examples: VET/higher education

- People with a skill and practical background have access to higher qualifications and LLL

- Centres of Higher Education: Increases relevance of Training/Education

- Industry:
  - Better qualified workers
  - Larger human resource pool of skilled workers.

PPP Examples - VET/higher education (add)

- Countries such as Australia, Canada, NZ, UK, USA, Germany, Switzerland and many others, see partnerships between VET and higher educational institutions as synergies, complementing each other to better serve economic growth.
- Bay of Plenty Polytechnic and Waikato, NZ
- Coffs Harbour - TAFE NSW/Southern Cross University share the same campus
- Fiji Institute of Technology/University of Newcastle
- Council of Australian Governments (COAG) – single ministerial council for tertiary education & employment

PPP Examples – Technology Parks

- The Australian Technology Park is an example of multiple small businesses in partnership with training organisations. A business and technology centre. It primarily houses start-up hi-tech companies, especially biotech firms. Original partner organisations include three Universities and the Sydney Institute of Technical and Further Education (TAFE), University of Technology, Sydney and University of New South Wales. The concept is designed to allow researchers to work on new technologies and be located alongside training organisations and companies with the capital and expertise to commercialise the new ideas. (www.atp.com.au)

PARTNERSHIPS NEED TO BE INNOVATIVE AND CREATIVE
Thank you
COP

SKILLS-AP
Community of Practice

- Similar to website but members can add information about events, organisations, technical resources and participate in discussion forums
- Join at skills-ap.ilo.bkk.or.th
- Go to New User

Free Technical Resources and information
- Competency-based Training - including all existing competency standards
- Qualification Framework publications
- Workplace Learning
- Resources on National TVET Systems, International Comparisons
- Quality Assurance
- Country information

THANK YOU
Let us again meet online!
5. References

1. ILO policy documents and research
www.ilo.org/skills/lang--en/index.htm


2. SKILLS-AP documents
Community of Practice: Become a Member!
www.skills-ap.ilobkk.or.th

3. Online encyclopaedias on TVET
www.unevoc.unesco.org
www.unevoc.unesco.org/tvetipedia.html?tx_drwiki_pi1[keyword]=index